

Journal of medical ethics

**The Journal of the
Society for the Study of Medical Ethics**

Editor

A V Campbell

Consulting Editors

A S Duncan

C M Fletcher

Editorial Board

R B Welbourn (Chairman)

Patrick Byrne

R Y Calne

R D Catterall

J Dominian

G R Dunstan

Roger Higgs

Lord Kilbrandon

Gordon Horobin

W S Peart

Raymond Plant

Dame Muriel Powell

Anthony Thorley

Sir Martin Roth

Cicely Saunders

Tony Smith

Edward Shotter

Technical Editor

Gunilla Liddle

Contents

155 Editorial

James C Blackie

Janus or looking both ways at once

Focus

**157 The care of the mentally abnormal offender
and the protection of the public**

Henry R Rollin

The concept of dangerousness

Alan Norton

Main articles

163 Medical practice: Defendants and prisoners

Paul Bowden

**173 The place of medicine in the American prison:
Ethical issues in the treatment of offenders**

Peter L Sissons

**180 Dilemmas of medical ethics in the Canadian
Penitentiary Service**

C Roy

**185 The just provision of health care: A reply to
Elizabeth Telfer**

Hillel Steiner Elizabeth Telfer

190 Case for a statutory 'definition of death'

P D G Skegg

**193 Is geriatrics the answer to the problems of old
age?**

I P H Millard II Brice Pitt III David Hobman

Case conference

200 Retreat from death?

Analysis

207 Equality

A V Campbell

209 The parliamentary scene

Tony Smith

211 Book reviews

213 News and notes

214 Correspondence

215 Lectures and symposia

a depressing ring about it. Much of the current anxiety about psychiatric treatment has been generated by groups opposed to orthodox psychiatry who believe that there is no place for drug treatment or any form of physical therapy. So much publicity has been given to their clamour that it was, perhaps, inevitable that the Medical Research Council should turn down the request by the Royal College of Psychiatrists for a grant for a controlled trial of psychosurgery. Fears and misconceptions have been encouraged by films such as 'One Flew Over the Cuckoo's Nest' - quoted in Parliament as evidence

of public concern though it was based on a fictional account of practices over 10 years' old in the USA. We need to remember that the vast majority of patients needing psychiatric help retain enough insight to accept informal admission, and that treatment given without the patient's consent remains the exception even with formal patients. Yet there are a few patients for whom compulsion is necessary: and to deny this may deprive them of their only hope of returning to sanity.

TONY SMITH

Contents of Volume 2, Number 3, 1976

Editorial

Main articles

Justice, welfare and health care
Elizabeth Telfer

'Side effects': A misnomer
C R B Joyce

The ethics of animal experimentation
W Lane-Petter

Copies can be obtained from the Publisher, *Journal of medical ethics*, Tavistock House East, Tavistock Square, London WC1H 9JR

Exorcism: A psychiatric viewpoint
W H Trethowan

Congenital abnormalities and selective abortion
Mary J Seller

Case conference
'The soft embalmer of the still midnight': A problem of prescribing hypnotics in general practice

Analysis

Liberty
Hillel Steiner

The parliamentary scene
Tony Smith

Correspondence

Book reviews

Lectures and symposia

News and notes

News and notes

Annual conference

Human sexuality is the subject of the 14th annual conference of the London Medical Group, which will be held in conjunction with the Society for the Study of Medical Ethics, on Friday and Saturday, 11 and 12 February 1977. The conference will be held at the Royal College of Surgeons of England, Lincoln's Inn Fields, London WC1.

The conference will examine past and present attitudes to human sexuality and their implications for members of the medical and other caring professions.

Chairmen and speakers will include: Professor R B Welbourn, Director of the Department of Surgery, Royal Postgraduate Medical School; Professor Robin Du Boulay, Professor of Medieval History, Bedford College; Dr Jack Dominian, consultant psychiatrist, Central Middlesex Hospital; Mr P D Trevor Roper, consultant ophthalmic surgeon, Westminster Hospital; Dr Roy Strong, Director, Victoria & Albert Museum; Professor Norman Morris, Dean of the Faculty of Medicine, University of London; Professor Marshall Marinker, Professor of Community Medicine, University of Leicester; Dr Malcolm Pines, consultant psychotherapist, Maudsley Hospital; Sir Denis Hill, Professor of Psychiatry, Institute of Psychiatry; Dr R D Catterall, Director, James Pringle House, Middlesex Hospital; Mrs Claire Rayner, medical journalist and agony columnist; Mr Peter Righton, author of *Counselling Homosexuals*; Professor Enda McDonagh, moral theologian, St Patrick's College, Maynooth.

Further information (SAE) and application forms (available after 3 January 1977) from the Conference Convenor, London Medical Group, Tavistock House East, Woburn Walk, WC1H 9LG

Medical weekend for students

Cumberland Lodge, Windsor Great Park, is arranging a further medical weekend from Friday to Sunday, 25 to 27 March 1977. Further details from the Conference Secretary, London Medical Group, Tavistock House East, Woburn Walk, WC1H 9LG. (SAE).

The Director in Poland

Following a visit of some Polish medical students to London in 1975, Edward Shotton, the Director of Studies of the Society, visited Warsaw, Lublin and Cracow in June 1976 to meet doctors and others interested in promoting the study of medical ethics in Poland.

Communication with the patient

The southern medical groups' conference on 'Communication with the patient' will be arranged by the Bristol Medical Group on Saturday, 23 April 1977. Further information from the Hon Secretary, Bristol Medical Group, Dr Chris Lovell, Department of Medicine, Bristol Royal Infirmary, Bristol BS2 8HW. (SAE).

First northern conference of the Society for the Study of Medical Ethics

The first northern conference of the Society for the Study of Medical Ethics will be held in the University of Edinburgh on 21 and 22 January 1977. The conference will deal with the subject of human birth. Further details and application forms from the Secretary, EMG Project Office, Top Flat Right, 24 Buccleuch Place, Edinburgh. (SAE).

Children, medicine and the law

The Newcastle Medical Group is arranging a conference on 'Children, medicine and the law' on Saturday, 12 March 1977. Further information from the Secretary,

Newcastle Medical Group, Department of Family and Community Medicine, University of Newcastle, St Thomas Street, Newcastle. (SAE).

James Blackie Memorial Fund

The first editorial in this issue is a tribute to James Blackie, a member from its inception of the Editorial Board of this Journal. One of his major interests was the restoration of old property for those with particular housing needs, including the disabled. And as this would have pleased him more than any lectureship or other memorial, it is proposed to establish a fund to make possible a good restoration of such an old building in Edinburgh, and call the house James Blackie House. Contributions, however small, should be sent to the Hon Treasurer, Edinvar Housing Association, New College, The Mound, Edinburgh.

The Editor of the *Journal of medical ethics* visits South Africa

In September the Editor of the *Journal of medical ethics* visited the Republic of South Africa at the invitation of the Medical Faculty of the University of Stellenbosch in order to attend a conference marking the official opening of the Faculty's teaching hospital at Tygerberg. The theme of the conference was 'Mankind and medicine in the third millennium'. Throughout the conference it was stressed that priorities in health care must be reallocated in the Republic of South Africa. In his paper, which was widely reported in the South African press, Dr Campbell indicated the dangers inherent in creating a system which would result in an escalating health problem for the majority of the population.

Correspondence

The utilization of animals

SIR,

In the 'Ethics of animal experimentation' (*Journal of medical ethics*, 2, 119-126), Lane-Petter writes:

'But there is a positive advantage in man exercising his dominance in dealing with animals in this [experiments] as in most other ways that bring him into intimate contact with animals. Whether in the laboratory, on the farm, in the zoo or the circus, hunting with gun or camera, harpoon or net, the people thus involved have to study and understand their subject. Understanding, among people of goodwill, brings respect, and respect is likely to be followed by considerate treatment and a general enrichment of life for both man and animal.'

As Clark notes in his comment (*Ibid*, p 125), this exhibits a considerable degree of naïveté. But more than this, the argument as an argument is spurious. It lumps together a range of different human-

animal associations and assumes that the human understanding of animals which genuinely characterizes some of these associations must somehow characterize all of them, a risky assumption about matters of fact which the facts themselves do not support.

It is certainly true that some understanding of animals is necessary in order to raise them successfully, to maintain them in zoos and circuses, and in the case of wild animals to find and kill them. But the kind of understanding which is necessary for the effective realization of these ends is scientific and technical and not at all the kind which includes or engenders respect for animals and considerate treatment of them. If the ill treatment of animals always had serious economic costs with no compensating benefits, then of course ill treatment would be a much rarer phenomenon than it in fact is. Unfortunately, at the vast commercial scale on which animals are produced and utilized in modern

industrialized societies, the systematic ill treatment of animals in great varieties of ways is economically and technologically most efficient and therefore most profitable. The understanding of animals necessary to produce and utilize them on a commercial scale is precisely an understanding of these efficiencies, including an understanding of the profits to be made by systematic ill treatment. The production and utilization of experimental animals on a commercial scale is probably no better and no worse than our production and utilization of animals for food, but the human understanding exercised in all of the human-animal associations is not even implicitly considerate and humane. To remind ourselves of this we need only consider the ethical problems posed by our use of humans as research subjects.

STUART M. BROWN, JR,
Program on Science, Technology and Society, 628 Clark Hall, Cornell University, Ithaca, New York 14853

News and notes—continued

New subscription rates for the *Journal of medical ethics*

Due to increased production costs and postage rates, the annual subscription for subscribers in the United Kingdom and the Irish Republic will be £12.00 and US \$25.00 in all countries overseas. The information relating to the purchase of the Journal is set out in full in the notice to subscribers on the page facing the Editorial.

Philosophers join New York teaching hospitals

From the *Harvard Bulletin* comes the interesting news that the Society for Philosophy and Public Affairs has received a grant from the New York Council for the Humanities so that philosophers

may be appointed to part-time positions in New York teaching hospitals for six months ending on 30 June 1977. Those so appointed will work with medical staff, nursing and medical students and patients to encourage interest in and knowledge of medical ethics and related philosophical topics. This interest and understanding will be aroused by means of lectures, symposia, notes in hospital newsletters and informal discussion. The programme will be directed by the Bio-Ethics Committee of the Society for Public Affairs.

Medical ethics debate in Israel

In a conference on 'Clinical research problems in endocrinology' to be held in Tel-Aviv, Israel, from 14 to 24 January 1977, some of

the topics to be discussed may be of interest to the readers of the *Journal of medical ethics*. In particular the papers on 'Abortion, contraception and the fetal rights', should continue the debate which has had so much publicity in Britain. Among the bodies sponsoring the meeting is the Society for Medicine and Law in Israel.

Bioethics Digest

A new publication concerned with medical ethics is the *Bioethics Digest* which is published monthly by Information Planning Associates Inc, Post Office Box 1523, Rockville, Maryland, USA. It costs \$48 a year, single copy \$6. Basically the *Digest* is an abstracts journal, but it also has feature articles.

Lectures and symposia

Tuesday 11 January

LMG symposium: DETENTION AND RELEASE OF MENTAL PATIENTS 5.45 pm St Bartholomew's Hospital

Professor C J Dickinson, Professor of Medicine, St Bartholomew's Hospital Medical College, His Honour Judge Eric Stockdale; Dr Henry Rollin, consultant psychiatrist, Horton Hospital; Professor Desmond Curran, Emeritus Professor of Psychiatry, University of London

Thursday 13 January

LMG symposium: AGE OF CONSENT: TIME FOR A CHANGE? 6 pm St George's Hospital, Tooting

Professor A H Crisp, Professor of Psychiatry, St George's Hospital Medical School; The Revd Dr Anthony Bird, Principal, Queen's College, Birmingham; Miss Jane Cousins, Secretary, Sexual Law Reform Society

Monday 17 January

EMG lecture: IS GERIATRICS THE ANSWER TO OLD AGE? 5.15 pm Edinburgh University Medical School

Monday 17 January

MMG symposium: THE ETHICS OF STERILIZATION 5.30 pm Stopford Building, Oxford Road, Manchester
Dr Rodney Harris, Reader in Medical Genetics; Professor The Revd Canon G R Dunstan, Professor of Moral and Social Theology, King's College, London; Dr D W Warrell, consultant obstetrician and gynaecologist

Tuesday 18 January

LMG symposium: SUICIDE: HAVE THE SAMARITANS THE ANSWER? 5.45 pm St Mary's Hospital Medical School

Professor W S Peart, Professor of Medicine, St Mary's Hospital; The Revd Prebendary Chad Varah, founder of the Samaritans; Dr Steven Greer, Department of Psychological Medicine, KCH

Thursday 20 January

LMG symposium: RENAL FAILURE IN CHILDREN: THE CONSEQUENCES OF DIALYSIS OR TRANSPLANTATION 5.45 pm St Thomas's Hospital

Professor Jon Scopes, Professor of Paediatrics, St Thomas's Hospital; Dr Cyril Chantler, consultant paediatrician, Guy's Hospital; Dr T Martin Barratt, senior lecturer in paediatric nephrology, Hospital for Sick Children; Mr Barry Hulme, consultant nephrologist, St Mary's Hospital

Thursday 20 January

GMG symposium: THE APARTHEID OF THE DISABLED 7.30 pm Western Infirmary, Glasgow

Monday 24 January

NMG symposium: HOW SAFE ARE YOU IN THE CASUALTY DEPARTMENT? 5.15 pm Royal Victoria Infirmary, Newcastle-upon-Tyne

Tuesday 25 January

LMG symposium: PAID FRIENDS FOR THE OLD: A CONSEQUENCE OF COMMUNITY GERIATRIC CARE? 5.45 pm UCH

Professor C G Clark, Professor of Surgery, UCH Medical School; Sir W Ferguson Anderson, Professor of Geriatric Medicine, University of Glasgow; Miss Averil Freeth, Assistant Director 'Age Concern'

Wednesday 26 January

EMG symposium: VASECTOMY: WHY AND WHEN? 1 pm Western General Hospital, Edinburgh

Thursday 27 January

LMG symposium: STERILIZATION OF THE YOUNG AND OTHERS INCAPABLE OF CONSENT 6.15 pm Westminster Medical School

Mr D M Forrest, consultant paediatric surgeon, Westminster Children's Hospital; Ralph Gibson, Esq, Recorder of the Crown Court; Dr Graeme Snodgrass, consultant paediatrician, The London Hospital; Dr Sheila Duncan,

senior lecturer in obstetrics and gynaecology, University of Sheffield

Monday 31 January

EMG lecture: PATIENTS' RIGHTS 5.15 pm Edinburgh University Medical School

Tuesday 1 February

LMG symposium: THE BEREAVEMENT OF STILLBIRTH 6 pm Charing Cross Hospital, Fulham

Dr Hugh Jolly, consultant paediatrician, Charing Cross Hospital; Dr Sandy Bourne, consultant psychotherapist, Tavistock Clinic; Dr David Morris, consultant paediatrician, British Hospital for Mothers and Babies

Wednesday 2 February

EMG symposium: NURSES: EDUCATED OR TRAINED? 1 pm Western General Hospital, Edinburgh

Thursday 3 February

LMG lecture: A DEATH IN THE FAMILY 5.45 pm Guy's Hospital Medical School

Dr Cicely Saunders, Medical Director, St Christopher's Hospice

Tuesday 8 February

SMG lecture: MORALE IN HOSPITALS: WHO CARES? 8 pm Medical School Sheffield

Professor Reginald Revans

Wednesday 9 February

EMG symposium: RADIATION RISKS 1 pm Western General Hospital, Edinburgh

Thursday 10 February

BMG symposium: THE BATTERED FAMILY 7.30 pm Bristol Royal Infirmary

Mrs Jean Renvoize, author of *Children in Danger*; a panel of local experts

Monday 14 February

MMG lecture: IRRECOVERABLE BRAIN DAMAGE 5.30 pm Stopford Building, Oxford Road, Manchester
Professor Bryan Jennett, Professor of Neurosurgery, Glasgow

Tuesday 15 February

LMG symposium: PHYSICAL DISABILITY IN THE COMMUNITY: DO DOCTORS CARE? 5.45 pm KCH Medical School

Mr E Maelor Thomas, orthopaedic surgeon, KCH; The Rt Hon Baroness Masham of Ilton, Countess of Swinton; Mr Peter London, accident surgeon, Birmingham Accident Hospital and Rehabilitation Centre

Wednesday 16 February

EMG symposium: CHILDREN AND DEATH 1 pm Western General Hospital, Edinburgh

Thursday 17 February

LMG symposium: CONTACT TRACING IN SEXUALLY TRANSMITTED DISEASES 5.45 pm The London Hospital Medical College

Dr Eric Dunlop, Whitechapel Clinic, The London Hospital; Miss Isobel Hunter, Health Education Council

Tuesday 22 February

LMG symposium: WHY DO NURSES HATE DOCTORS? 5.45 pm Middlesex Hospital Medical School

Mr Stuart Steele, Director, Department of Obstetrics and Gynaecology, Middlesex Hospital Medical School; Miss Jennifer Wilson-Barnett, research nurse, Guy's Hospital; Miss Janet Craig, Assistant Director, King's Fund Centre; Dr Nelson Coghill, consultant physician, West Middlesex Hospital

Wednesday 23 February

EMG lecture: TERMINAL CARE: ITS NATURE AND MANAGEMENT 5.15 pm Edinburgh University Medical School

Thursday 24 February

CMG symposium: WHAT IS HEALTH? 5.30 pm Welsh National School of Medicine, Cardiff

Dr Stephen Gang, general practitioner, Cardiff; Dr Julian Tudor Hart, general practitioner, Glyn Corrwg; Dr Una Kroll, general practitioner (and deaconess), South London

Thursday 24 February

LMG symposium: CRUELTY IN HOSPITALS 5.45 pm Royal Free Hospital, Hampstead

Dr Anthony Smith, Medical Correspondent, *The Times*; Dr Anthony Clare, senior lecturer, Institute of Psychiatry; Dr Anthony Whitehead, consultant psychogeriatrician, Brighton;

W K Ankers, PhD, formerly of St Augustine's Hospital, Canterbury

Thursday 24 February

GMG symposium: EXORCISM 5.30 pm Royal Infirmary, Glasgow

Monday 28 February

MMG symposium: THE THERAPEUTIC LIE: DECEPTION IN CLINICAL PRACTICE 5.30 pm Hope Hospital, Salford

Tuesday 1 March

LMG symposium: EXORCISM: AN UNQUALIFIED DISASTER? 5.45 pm St Bartholomew's Hospital

Professor Ian McColl, Professor of Surgery, Guy's Hospital; the Revd Don Cupitt, Dean, Emmanuel College, Cambridge; Dr William Sargent, hon consultant psychiatrist, St Thomas's Hospital

Thursday 3 March

LMG symposium: INCEST 6 pm St George's Hospital, Tooting, London

Dr Paul d'Orbán, consultant psychiatrist, St George's Hospital; Mrs Pauline Crabbe, Brook Advisory Centre; Miss D J Tibbits, senior probation officer, Dorset Probation and After-care Service; Professor John Mason, Professor of Forensic Medicine, Edinburgh University

Tuesday 8 March

LMG symposium: COT DEATHS 5.45 pm St Mary's Hospital Medical School

Professor Thomas Oppé, Professor of Paediatrics, St Mary's Hospital; Lady Limerick, Vice-Chairman, Foundation for the Study of Infant Deaths; Professor John Emery, consultant paediatric pathologist, The Children's Hospital, Sheffield; Dr Robert Walker, family doctor and parent

Tuesday 8 March

CMG symposium: TOO OLD TO CARE? 5.30 pm Welsh National School of Medicine, Cardiff

Dr S L Willington, consultant physician in geriatrics; Dr John Agate, consultant geriatrician, Ipswich; Adrian Evans, Esq, Area Administrator, South Glam AHA; Professor Alan Williams, Department of Economics, University of York

Thursday 10 March

LMG symposium: THE ETHICS OF INFANTICIDE 5.45 pm St Thomas's Hospital

Dr W D Wylie, Dean, St Thomas's Hospital; The Rt

Hon Lord Justice Lawton, Lord Justice of Appeal; Dr Elizabeth Tylden, consultant psychiatrist, St Mary's Hospital; Jonathon Glover, PhD

Tuesday 15 March

LMG lecture: THE END OF THE DOCTOR-PATIENT RELATIONSHIP 5.45 pm UCH Medical School

Professor Marshall Marinker, Professor of Community Medicine, University of Leicester

Thursday 17 March

LMG symposium: THE AVAILABILITY OF ABORTION: A GEOGRAPHY OF MORALS 6.15 pm Westminster Medical School

Dr Richard Farmer, senior lecturer in community medicine, Westminster Medical School; Professor Francois Lafitte, Professor of Social Policy and Administration, University of Birmingham; Mrs Juliet Cheetham, lecturer in applied social studies; University of Oxford

Tuesday 22 March

BMG lecture: ABUSES OF CLINICAL INVESTIGATION 7.30 pm Bristol Royal Infirmary

Dr M H Pappaworth, author of *Human Guinea Pigs*

Tuesday 22 March

LMG symposium: THE MISUSE OF PSYCHIATRY: NOT ONLY IN THE SOVIET UNION 6 pm Charing Cross Hospital, Fulham Palace Road

Dr Malcolm Weller, lecturer in psychiatry, Charing Cross Hospital; Professor John Wing, Professor of Social Psychiatry, Institute of Psychiatry; Larry Gostin, Esq, legal advisor, MIND

Thursday 24 March

LMG symposium: SEX AND THE DISABLED 5.45 pm Guy's Hospital Medical School

Dr Donald Craig, hon lecturer in general practice, Guy's Hospital Medical School; W F R Stewart, Esq, Development Officer, Committee on Sexual Problems of the Disabled; Roy Billington, Esq, counsellor and advisor, Cheshire Foundation; Dr Wendy Greengross, general practitioner, broadcaster and author

Monday 28 March

NMG symposium: STUDENTS UNDER STRESS 5.15 pm Royal Victoria Infirmary, Newcastle-upon-Tyne

Dr Graham Grant, University

Health Service; Mrs Janet Clark, social worker; Dr Humphrey Richardson, consultant psychiatrist

Tuesday 5 April

BMG lecture: THE VALUE OF HUMAN LIFE 7.30 pm Bristol Royal Infirmary

Metropolitan Anthony of Sourozh

Wednesday 13 April

BMG symposium: DRUG PROMOTION - IN WHOSE INTEREST? 7.30 pm Bristol Royal Infirmary

Dr Clifford Hawkins, consultant physician, Birmingham; Dr Miriam Stoppard, Medical Director, Syntex Pharmaceuticals

Tuesday 19 April

LMG lecture: MARITAL BREAKDOWN 5.45 pm KCH Medical School

Dr Jack Dominian, consultant psychiatrist, Central Middlesex Hospital

Thursday 21 April

LMG symposium: CLINICAL AND ETHICAL ASPECTS OF GENDER IDENTITY 5.45 pm The London Hospital Medical College

Dr Stuart Mason, consultant endocrinologist, The London Hospital; Dr John Randell, consultant psychiatrist, Charing Cross Hospital; Peter Byrne, Esq, moral philosopher, King's College, London

Monday 25 April

NMG lecture: WHAT SHOULD WE DO ABOUT BAD DOCTORS? 5.15 pm Royal Victoria Infirmary, Newcastle-upon-Tyne

Professor John N. Walton, Dean of Medicine; Dr Donald Irvine, family doctor, Hon. Sec, Royal College of General Practitioners, member of the Merrison Committee

Tuesday 26 April

LMG symposium: TREATMENT BY PHONE-IN: THE NEXT STEP BEFORE COMPUTERS? 5.45 pm Middlesex Hospital Medical School

Dr R D Catterall, Director, James Pringle House, Middlesex Hospital; Dr Hugh Jolly, consultant paediatrician, Charing Cross Hospital; Mrs Anna Raeburn,

journalist on *Woman*; Professor Eric Wilkes, Professor of Community Care and General Practice, University of Sheffield

Thursday 28 April

LMG symposium: THE MEDICAL AND SOCIAL CONSEQUENCES OF SUDDEN DISASTERS 5.45 pm Royal Free Hospital, Hampstead

Mr Colin Madgwick, orthopaedic surgeon, Royal Free Hospital; Surgeon Rear-Admiral Stanley Miles, Medical Director, Health Assessment Centre, Cardiff; Miss Audrey Davey, family case worker, Wales Council for the Disabled, formerly of Aberfan

Tuesday 3 May

LMG symposium: NEUROLOGICAL AND SOCIAL CONSEQUENCES OF HUNTINGTON'S CHOREA 5.45 pm St Bartholomew's Hospital

Dr Patrick Cox, Department of Child Health, St Bartholomew's; Professor Charles Marsden, Professor of Neurology, Institute of Psychiatry; Dr Adrian Caro, Director, Huntington's Chorea Research Project

Tuesday 3 May

CMG symposium: WHO'S HAVING THE BABY: THE MOTHER OR THE OBSTETRICIAN? 5.30 pm Welsh National School of Medicine, Cardiff

Miss Christine Chapman, Director, Advanced Nursing Studies, University Hospital of Wales; Professor Peter Huntingford, Department of Obstetrics and Gynaecology, The London Hospital and St Bartholomew's Hospital; Professor B Hibbard, Department of Obstetrics and Gynaecology

Thursday 5 May

LMG symposium: FRINGE MEDICINE: CAN IT EVER BE PART OF THE NHS? 6 pm St George's Hospital, Tooting

Professor A E Bennett, Professor of Clinical Epidemiology and Social Medicine, St George's Hospital Medical School; Dr Ralph Twentymen, consultant physician, Royal London Homeopathic Hospital; Albert Rumfitt, Esq, Dean Emeritus, British College of Naturopathy and Homeopathy

Thursday 5 May

BMG symposium: THE NURSE AS A LEARNER AND AS A TEACHER 7.30 pm Bristol Royal Infirmary

Professor Reginald Revans, author of *Action Learning in Hospitals*; Dr Alison Tierney, lecturer in nursing studies, Edinburgh

Monday 9 May

MMG lecture: REASSURANCE 5.30 pm Stopford Building, Oxford Road, Manchester

Professor W I N Kessel, Professor of Psychiatry, University of Manchester

Tuesday 10 May

LMG symposium: WHO'S HAVING THE BABY: THE MOTHER OR THE OBSTETRICIAN? 5.45 pm St Mary's Hospital Medical School

Professor Richard Beard, Professor of Obstetrics and Gynaecology, St Mary's Hospital; Mr B Victor Lewis, consultant obstetrician and gynaecologist, Watford General Hospital; Mrs Shiela Kitzinger, childbirth educationist and social anthropologist

Thursday 12 May

LMG symposium: HAVE WE MADE ADOLESCENCE A DISEASE? 5.45 pm St Thomas's Hospital

Professor W I Cranston, Professor of Medicine, St Thomas's Hospital; Dr Stephen Wolkind, senior lecturer in psychiatry, the London Hospital; Dr Moses Laufer, Director, Brent Consultation Centre

Tuesday 17 May

LMG symposium: TRANQUILLIZERS: TREATMENT OF PATIENT OR DOCTOR? 5.45 pm UCH Medical School

Professor A Brant, Professor of Clinical Obstetrics and Gynaecology, UCH Medical School; Dr John Stevens, general practitioner, Aldeburgh; Dr J D Pollitt, Department of Psychological Medicine, St Thomas's Hospital

Wednesday 15 June

BMG lecture: THE LARGE TEACHING HOSPITAL - A DISASTER IN THE THIRD WORLD? 7.30 pm Bristol Royal Infirmary

Dr David Morley, reader in tropical child health

Journal of medical ethics

**Volume two
Numbers 1-4**

**The Journal of the
Society for the Study of Medical Ethics**

Editor

A V Campbell

Consulting Editors

A S Duncan

C M Fletcher

Editorial Board

R B Welbourn (Chairman)

Patrick Byrne

R Y Calne

R D Catterall

J Dominian

G R Dunstan

Roger Higgs

Lord Kilbrandon

Gordon Horobin

W S Peart

Raymond Plant

Dame Muriel Powell

Anthony Thorley

Sir Martin Roth

Cicely Saunders

Tony Smith

Edward Shotter

Technical Editor

Gunilla Liddle

Society for the Study of Medical Ethics,
Tavistock Square, London WC1

Index to volume 2

- A**
 Abnormalities, congenital, and selective abortion, 2, 138-141
 Abortion, selective, and congenital abnormalities, 2, 138-141
 Abuse, barbiturate, 2, 63-67
 Animals, benefits for man and, 2, 106
 America, report from, 2, 97-98
 Amniocentesis, issues of public policy in the USA raised by, 2, 8-11
 Animal experimentation, the ethics of, 2, 118-126
 Animal experimentation, the ethics of: *Commentary*, 2, 122-126
- Analysis** (alphabetical list of titles)
 Equality, 2, 206-207
 Liberty, 2, 147-148
 Morality and religion, 2, 93-94
 Natural law, 2, 34-36
- Arnold, A, and Moseley, R: Ethical issues arising from human genetics, 2, 12-17
- B**
 Bancroft, John: Dr Bancroft replies, 2, 26-27
 Barber, Barry, Cohen, R D, Kenny, D J, Rowson, J, and Scholes, Maureen: Some problems of confidentiality in medical computing, 2, 71-73
 Barbiturate abuse, 2, 63-67
 Barbiturate dependence, what is, and who is at risk, 2, 58-62
 Barbiturates, the moral choice in prescribing, 2, 68-70
- Book reviews** (alphabetical list of titles)
 Case of Leonid Plyushch, ed. by Tatyana Khodorovich, 2, 210
 Health Care: The Growing Dilemma, by Robert Maxwell, 2, 210-211
 Health is for People, by Michael Wilson, 2, 102
 Houseman's Tale, by Colin Douglas, 2, 103
 Human Medicine: Ethical perspectives on New Medical Issues, by James B Nelson, 2, 152
 Human Rights in Health, edited by Katherine Elliot and Julie Knight, 2, 100-103
- Jewish Medical Ethics: A Comparative and Historical Study of the Jewish Religious Attitudes to Medicine and its Practice, by Immanuel Jakobovits, 2, 44
 Law and ethics of AID and Embryo Transfer, 2, 100-103
 Moral Dilemmas in Medicine—A Coursebook in Ethics for Doctors and Nurses (2nd ed), Alastair V Campbell, 2, 44
 Some Mothers' Experiences of Induced Labour, document submitted by Sheila Kitzinger from the National Childbirth Trust, 2, 101
 Value for Money in Health Services, by Brian Abel-Smith, 2, 210-211
- Bowden, Paul: Medical practice. Dependants and prisoners, 2, 103-172
- C**
 Campbell, A V : Equality, 2, 206-207
 Canadian Penitentiary Service, dilemmas of medical ethics in, 2, 180-184
- Case conference** (alphabetical list of titles)
 Confidentiality, limits of, 2, 28-33
 Death, retreat from? 2, 199-205
 'Soft embalmer of the still midnight'
 Volunteers at risk, 2, 87-92
- Christie, David J: Volunteers at risk (Case conference), 2, 90-91
 Clark, Stephen R L: Licensed torture? in *Commentary* on the ethics of animal experimentation, 2, 125-126
 Cohen, R D *et al.*: Some problems of confidentiality in medical computing, 2, 71-73
 Computing, medical, some problems of confidentiality in, 2, 71-73
 Confidentiality, some problems in medical computing, 2, 71-73
 Connell, Philip H: What is barbiturate dependence and who is at risk? 2, 58-62
 Cooper, F B K: The literature of medical ethics: A review of the writings of Hans Jonas, 2, 39-43
- Correspondence** (alphabetical list of titles)
 Language, turgid and obscure, 2, 151
 Reproduce, a woman's right to, 2, 45
 Sterilization, child, 2, 99
 Unconscious patients, ethics and legalities relating to, 2, 151
- Cupitt, Don: *Comment* on Exorcism: A psychiatric viewpoint, 2, 134-135
- D**
 Dependence, barbiturate, what is and who is at risk, 2, 58-62
 Dunn, Ian, and Schröck, Ruth: *Commentary* on 'Homosexuality and the medical profession: A behaviourist's view' by John Bancroft, 2, 24-27
- E**
Editorial (alphabetical list of titles)
 Blackie, James, C, 2, 155
 Doctors, industrial action by, 2, 1-2
 Ethics and priorities, 2, 105-06
 Ethics, medical, and philosophy, 2, 1-2
 Incurable patient, death and the, 2, 2
 Interdisciplines, 2, 51
 Janus, or looking both ways at once, 2, 155-156
- Etzioni, Amitai: Issues of public policy in the USA raised by amniocentesis, 2, 8-11
 Exorcism: A psychiatric viewpoint, 2, 127-137
- F**
Focus: Current issues in medical ethics (alphabetical list of titles)
 Dangerousness, the concept of, 2, 161
 Mentally abnormal offender, the case of, and the protection of the public, 2, 157
 Protection of the public, and the case of the mentally abnormal offender, 2, 157
 Quinlan, Karen, the case of: Problems and proposals, 2, 3
- G**
 Genetics, human, ethical issues arising from, 2, 12-17
 Geriatrics, the answer to the problems of old age?, 2, 192-198

H

Health care, the just provision of: A reply to Elizabeth Telfer, 2, 185-189
 Health care, the just provision of: Three points at issue, 2, 188-189
 Hegarty, T W, and Rowan, A N: *Commentary* on the ethics of animal experimentation, 2, 122-124
 Hepburn, R W: Morality and religion, 2, 93-94
 Herxheimer, Andrew, and Higgs, Roger: *Commentary* on 'Side' effects: A misnomer, 2, 115-117
 Higgs, Roger, and Herxheimer, Andrew: *Commentary* on 'Side' effects: A misnomer, 2, 115-117
 Hobman, David: Is geriatrics the answer to the problems of old age? 2, 192-198
 'Homosexuality and the medical profession: A behaviourist's view' by John Bancroft, 2, 24-27
 Hughes, Gerard J: Natural law, 2, 34-36

J

Jonas, Hans, a review of the writings of: 2, 39-43
 Jones, J S P, and Metcalfe, D H H: The teaching of medical ethics in the Nottingham Medical School, 2, 83-86
 Joyce, C R B: 'Side' effects: A misnomer, 2, 112-117
 Justice, welfare and health care, 2, 107-111

K

Kennedy, Ian McColl: The Karen Quinlan case: Problems and proposals, 2, 3-7
 Kenny, D J *et al.*: Some problems of confidentiality in medical computing, 2, 71-73

L

Lane-Petter, W: The ethics of animal experimentation, 2, 118-126
 Lectures and symposia: *See* Medical groups

M

McKay, Angus S: *Comment* on Congenital abnormalities and selective abortion, 2, 140-141
 Marteau, Louis: *Comment* on Exorcism: A psychiatric viewpoint, 2, 135-137
 May, William, W: Volunteers at risk (Case conference), 2, 91-92
 Medical ethics, the implications of, 2, 74-82
 Medical ethics, is a moral consensus possible in, 2, 18-23

Medical ethics, the literature of: A review of the writings of Hans Jonas, 2, 39-43
 Medical ethics, the teaching of: In the Nottingham Medical School, 2, 83-86
 Medical practice: Defendants and prisoners, 2, 163-172

Medical groups (alphabetical list of titles)

Calendar for the summer term, 2, 49
 Lectures and symposia, 2, 153-154; 214-216

Metcalfe, D H H, and Jones, J S P: The teaching of medical ethics in the Nottingham Medical School, 2, 83-86
 Millard, P H: Is geriatrics the answer to the problems of old age? 2, 192-198
 Mitchell, Basil: Is a moral consensus in medical ethics possible? 2, 18-23
 Moseley, R, and Arnold, A: Ethical issues arising from human genetics, 2, 12-17

N

Natural law, 2, 34-36
 News and notes, 2, 46-48; 104; 154; 213-214
 Norton, Alan: The concept of dangerousness, 2, 161

O

Offenders, ethical issues in the treatment of, 2, 173-179
 d'Orbán, P T: Barbiturate abuse, 2, 63-67

P

Parliamentary scene, the (alphabetical list of titles)
 Congenital Disabilities (Civil Liability) Bill debate in the House of Commons, 2, 95-96
 Lords, House of, medical ethics in, 2, 37-38
 Prisoners, dependants and: Medical practice, 2, 163-172
 Private beds and clinical judgment, 2, 149-150
 Treatment, consent to, 2, 208-209

Pitt, Brice: Is geriatrics the answer to the problems of old age? 2, 192-198
 Prison, the American, the place of medicine in: Ethical issues in the treatment of offenders, 2, 173-179

R

Rollin, Henry R: The care of the mentally abnormal offender and the protection of the public, 2, 157

Rowan, A N, and Hegarty, T W: *Commentary* on the ethics of animal experimentation, 2, 122-124
 Rowson, J *et al.*: Some problems of confidentiality in medical computing, 2, 71-73
 Roy, C: Dilemmas of medical ethics in the Canadian Penitentiary Service, 2, 180-184
 Ryder, Richard D: *Commentary* on the ethics of animal experimentation, 2, 124-125

S

Scholes, Maureen *et al.*: Some problems of confidentiality in medical computing, 2, 71-73
 Schröck, Ruth, and Dunn, Ian: *Commentary* on 'Homosexuality and the medical profession: A behaviourist's view' by John Bancroft, 2, 24-27
 Seller, Mary J: Congenital abnormalities and selective abortion, 2, 138-141
 'Side' effects: A misnomer, 2, 112-117
 Sissons, Peter L: The place of medicine in the American prison: Ethical issues in the treatment of offenders, 2, 173-179
 Skegg, P D G: The case for a statutory 'definition of death', 2, 190-191
 Smith, Tony: The parliamentary scene, 2, 37-38; 2, 95-96; 2, 149-150; 2, 208-209
 Speciesism, 2, 124-125
 Statutory 'definition of death', the case for, 2, 190-191
 Steiner, Hillel: Liberty, 2, 147-148
 Steiner, Hillel: The just provision of health care: A reply to Elizabeth Telfer, 2, 185-189

T

Teamwork, interdisciplinary, 2, 52-57
 Telfer, Elizabeth: Justice, welfare and health care, 2, 107-111
 Telfer, Elizabeth: The just provision of health care: Three points at issue, 2, 188-189
 Thompson, Ian E: The implications of medical ethics, 2, 74-82
 Torture, licensed? 2, 125-126
 Towers, Bernard: Report from America, 2, 97-98
 Trethowan, W H: Exorcism: A psychiatric viewpoint, 2, 127-137

W

Wachter, M De: Interdisciplinary teamwork, 2, 52-57
 Wells, Frank: The moral choice in prescribing barbiturates, 2, 68-70

President Lord Amulree
 Director of Studies Edward Shotter
 Scottish Director Kenneth Boyd
 Honorary Assistant Director
 Anthony Thorley
 Treasurer Kenneth Darke
 Chairman, Editorial Board
 R B Welbourn
 Editor, *Journal of medical ethics*
 A V Campbell
 Consulting Editors
 A S Duncan C M Fletcher
 Technical Editor Gunilla Liddle
 Secretaries Penny Stewart
 Helen Horton

Governing Body

Lord Amulree
 Chairman
 P S de Q Cabot
 Management consultant
 R D Catterall
 Consultant venereologist, Middlesex
 Hospital
 A S Duncan
 Executive Dean, Faculty of Medicine,
 University of Edinburgh
 G R Dunstan
 Professor of Moral & Social Theology,
 King's College, London
 C D Falconer
 Scottish Secretary, British Medical
 Association
 C M Fletcher
 Professor of Clinical Epidemiology,
 Royal Postgraduate Medical School
 T W A Glenister
 Dean and Professor of Anatomy, Char-
 ing Cross Hospital Medical School
 Sir Cyril Kleinwort
 Chairman, Finance and General
 Purposes Committee
 O M Lidwell
 Medical Research Council
 Dame Muriel Powell
 Chief Nursing Officer, Scottish Home
 & Health Department
 R B Welbourn
 Professor of Surgery, Royal Post-
 graduate Medical School
 Sir Brian Windeyer
 Formerly Vice-Chancellor, University
 of London
 Dorian Haskard
 Middlesex Hospital Medical School
 Paul Nunn
 University College Hospital Medical
 School
 Colin Ball
 St Thomas's Hospital Medical School
 Tim Helme
 Middlesex Hospital Medical School
 Edward Shotter
 Director of Studies *ex officio*

Society for the Study of Medical Ethics

The Society for the Study of Medical Ethics is an independent, non-partisan organization for the multidisciplinary study of issues raised by the practice of medicine.

The Society aims to influence the quality of both professional and public discussion of medico-moral questions; to promote the study of medical ethics; to ensure a high academic standard for this developing subject; to encourage a multidisciplinary approach to discussion of the consequences of clinical practice; to stimulate research in specific problems; to remain non-partisan and independent of all interest groups and lobbies.

Since 1963 the London Medical Group, a student group for the study of issues raised by the practice of medicine, has arranged a series of lectures and symposia, now twice weekly throughout the academic year, in the 12 London teaching hospitals and medical schools.

In 1967 the Edinburgh Medical Group was established with similar aims, and subsequently medical groups have been formed in a majority of the British medical schools—currently Newcastle, Sheffield, Glasgow, Bristol, Birmingham, Manchester, Liverpool and Cardiff.

In 1972 junior doctors, who had themselves been associated with the London Medical Group, founded the Society for the Study of Medical Ethics to develop these aims at a postgraduate level.

DOCUMENTATION in Medical Ethics, superseded as the organ of the Society by the *Journal of medical ethics*, is now produced as the proceedings of the annual conference held in conjunction with the London Medical Group.

In 1975 research fellows were appointed by the Edinburgh Medical Group which has established, in conjunction with the University of Edinburgh, a research project in medical ethics and education. This is funded by the Leverhulme Trust Fund and the Nuffield Provincial Hospitals Trust.

The Society for the Study of Medical Ethics is a registered educational charity and a Company Limited by Guarantee. It relies on voluntary grants and donations and is not supported from government sources.

There is no individual membership of the Society. Those interested in this work are invited to subscribe to the *Journal of medical ethics*. The lectures of the London Medical Group and the other associated medical groups, although addressed primarily to medical, nursing and other students, are open to all those professionally interested. There is no charge.

ADDRESS: Society for the Study of Medical Ethics
 Tavistock House East, Tavistock Square, London, WC1H 9LG.
 Tel: 01-387 8132